

Measure Background

Three decades of research have consistently demonstrated that patients that have their high-risk surgery at a hospital and by a surgeon that have more experience with the procedure have better outcomes, including lower mortality rates, lower complication rates, and a shorter length of stay than for patients who have their surgery done at a hospital or by a surgeon with less experience.¹⁻²⁷ A recent study of cancer surgeries by the California Health Care Foundation further points to the relationship between very low volumes of cancer surgeries and poor patient outcomes.²⁸ The study concluded that there is an association between low hospital surgery volume and higher mortality and complication rates for the following cancers: bladder, brain, breast, colon, esophagus, liver, lung, pancreas, prostate, rectum, and stomach. The study also found that the majority of California's hospitals performed surgery for one or more of these 11 cancers only once or twice in 2014. Of cancer patients who had surgery at a hospital that did a small number of those surgeries in 2014, more than 70% were within 50 miles of a hospital performing higher volumes.

A more recent study found that most US health systems had one or more hospitals performing a low-volume surgery that is associated with inferior surgical outcomes despite the availability of a different in-network hospital that met the volume standard. On average, patients would need to travel no more than 30 miles to reach the in-network high-volume hospital.¹

Furthermore, a study of the relationship between surgeon volume and outcomes for eight cardiovascular procedures and cancer resections showed that surgeon volume was significantly related to operative mortality for all eight procedures studied.²⁹ The adjusted odds ratios for operative death among patients of low-volume surgeons as compared with patients of high-volume surgeons were as high as 3.61.

Lower surgical mortality at high-volume hospitals does not simply reflect more skillful surgeons and fewer technical errors with the procedure itself. More likely, it reflects more proficiency with all aspects of care underlying successful surgery, including patient

selection, anesthesia, and postoperative care.³⁰

Surgical Volume

Based on the research by Dartmouth-Hitchcock Medical Center, Michigan Medicine, and Johns Hopkins Medicine, as well as guidance from [Leapfrog's National Surgical Expert Panel](#), Leapfrog has identified eleven high-risk procedures for which there is a strong volume-outcome relationship. The procedures are:

- Bariatric surgery for weight loss
- Esophageal resection for cancer
- Lung resection for cancer
- Pancreatic resection for cancer
- Rectal cancer surgery
- Carotid endarterectomy
- Open aortic procedures
- Mitral valve repair and replacement
- Norwood procedure
- Total knee replacement
- Total hip replacement

Hospital and Surgeon Volume Standards

To achieve the standard for each applicable procedure, hospitals must:

1. Meet the minimum hospital volume standard for the procedure and
2. Have a process for privileging surgeons that includes the surgeon meeting or exceeding the minimum annual surgeon volume standard for the procedure

To achieve the standard for mitral valve repair and replacement procedures, a hospital must:

1. Meet the minimum hospital volume standard for the procedure
2. Have a process for privileging surgeons that includes meeting or exceeding the minimum annual surgeon volume standard for the procedure
3. Participate in the Society of Thoracic Surgeons (STS) Adult Cardiac Surgery Database (ACSD)
4. Have a Mitral Valve Repair/Replacement Composite Score of 3 Stars

To achieve the standard for Norwood procedure, a hospital must:

1. Meet the minimum hospital volume standard for the procedure
2. Have a process for privileging surgeons that includes meeting or exceeding the minimum annual surgeon volume standard for the procedure
3. Participate in the Society of Thoracic Surgeons (STS) Congenital Heart Surgery Database (CHSD)

The procedures and their corresponding minimum hospital volumes and minimum annual surgeon volumes for credentialing are shown in the table below.

Procedure	Annual Hospital Volume	Annual Surgeon Volume for Privileging
Bariatric surgery for weight loss	50	20
Esophageal resection for cancer	20	7
Lung resection for cancer	40	15
Pancreatic resection for cancer	20	10
Rectal cancer surgery	16	6
Carotid endarterectomy	20	10
Open aortic procedures	10	7
Mitral valve repair and replacement	40	20
Norwood procedure	8	5
Total knee replacement	50	25
Total hip replacement	50	25

Download the complete Leapfrog Hospital Survey scoring algorithms document at [Hospital Scoring and Results webpage](#).

Why Purchasers Need to Get Involved

Because lower volumes of high-risk surgeries have been tied to poorer surgical outcomes, such as increased rates of mortality and complications, purchasers can help save thousands of patients' lives by guiding them to hospitals and surgeons that meet or exceed the outlined surgical volume standards. Furthermore, surgical complications are costly mistakes. Not only do surgical complications increase the cost of surgery they also increase the risk of costly readmissions. Research has shown that hospitals that have very low volumes for particular surgical procedures place patients at a significantly higher risk of death or unplanned readmission. To avoid the risk of increased costs due to surgical complications and readmissions, purchasers should be encouraging patients to seek their surgeries at hospitals and by surgeons that have met or exceeded minimum volume standards.

References

1. Kalata S, Schaefer SL, Nuliyahu U, Ibrahim AM, Nathan H. Low-Volume Elective Surgery and Outcomes in Medicare Beneficiaries Treated at Hospital Networks. *JAMA Surg.* 2023 Dec 27
2. Lidsky ME, Sun Z, Nussbaum DP, Adam MA, Speicher PJ, Blazer III DG. Going the Extra Mile: Improved Survival for Pancreatic Cancer Patients Traveling to High-volume Centers. *Annals of Surgery.* 2017 Jan 6.
3. Zettervall SL, Schermerhorn ML, Soden PA, McCallum JC, Shean KE, Deery SE, O'Malley AJ, Landon B. The effect of surgeon and hospital volume on mortality after open and endovascular repair of abdominal aortic aneurysms. *Journal of Vascular Surgery.* 2016 Dec 14.
4. Fuchs HF, Harnsberger CR, Broderick RC, Chang DC, Sandler BJ, Jacobsen GR, Bouvet M, Horgan S. Mortality after esophagectomy is heavily impacted by center volume: retrospective analysis of the Nationwide Inpatient Sample. *Surgical Endoscopy.* 2016 Sep 22:1-7.
5. Speicher PJ, Englum BR, Ganapathi AM, Wang X, Hartwig MG, D'Amico TA, Berry MF. Traveling to a High-volume Center is Associated With Improved Survival for Patients With Esophageal Cancer. *Annals of surgery.* 2016 Mar.
6. David EA, Cooke DT, Chen Y, Perry A, Canter RJ,

- Cress R. Surgery in high-volume hospitals not commission on cancer accreditation leads to increased cancer-specific survival for early-stage lung cancer. *The American Journal of Surgery*. 2015 Oct 31;210(4):643-7.
7. Sternberg S, Dougherty G. Risks Are High at LowVolume Hospitals. *U.S. News & World Report*. May 18, 2015. Available at: <https://www.usnews.com/news/articles/2015/05/18/risks-are-high-at-low-volume-hospitals-9>.
 8. Vassileva CM, McNeely C, Spertus J, Markwell S, Hazelrigg S. Hospital volume, mitral repair rates, and mortality in mitral valve surgery in the elderly: an analysis of US hospitals treating Medicare fee-for-service patients. *The Journal of thoracic and cardiovascular surgery*. 2015 Mar 31;149(3):762-8
 9. Reames BN, Ghaferi AA, Birkmeyer JD, Dimick JB. Hospital volume and operative mortality in the modern era. *Ann Surg*. 2014 Aug;260(2):244-51.
 10. Birkmeyer NJO, Dimick JB, Share D., et al., Hospital complication rates with bariatric surgery in Michigan. *JAMA*, 2010, 304(1):435-442.
 11. Birkmeyer JD, Sun Y, Wong SL, Stukel TA. Hospital volume and late survival after cancer surgery. *Annals of surgery*. 2007 May 1;245(5):777-83.
 12. Weller W, Hannan E. Relationship between provider volume and postoperative complications for bariatric procedures in New York State. *Journal of the American College of Surgeon* 2006; 202(5):753-761.
 13. Ngyuen N, et al., The relationship between hospital volume and outcome in bariatric surgery at academic medical centers. *Annals of Surgery* 2004; 240(4):586- 594.
 14. Courcoulas A, et al., The relationship of surgeon and hospital volume to outcome after gastric bypass surgery in Pennsylvania: A 3-year summary. *Surgery* 2003; 134(4):613- 623.
 15. Birkmeyer JD, Siewers AE, Finlayson EVA, Stukel TA, Lucas FL, Batista I, Welch HG, Wennberg DE. Hospital volume and surgical mortality in the United States, *New England Journal of Medicine* 2002;346:1137- 1144.
 16. Bach PB, Cramer LD, Schrag D, Downey RJ, Gelfand SE, Begg CB. The influence of hospital volume on survival after resection for lung cancer. *New England Journal of Medicine*. 2001 Jul 19;345(3):181-8.
 17. Dudley RA, Johansen KL, Brand R, Rennie DJ, Milstein A. Selective Referral to High- Volume Hospitals: Estimating Potentially Avoidable Deaths. *JAMA*. 2000; 283:1159-1166.
 18. Begg CB, Cramer LD, Hoskins WJ, Brennan MF. Impact of hospital volume on operative mortality for major cancer surgery. *JAMA*. 1998; 280:1747-51.
 19. Cebul RD, Snow RJ, Pine R, Hertzner NR, Norris DG. Indications, outcomes, and provider volumes for carotid endarterectomy. *JAMA*. 1998; 279:1282-7.
 20. Dardik A, Burleyson GP, Bowman H, et al. Surgical repair of ruptured abdominal aortic aneurysms in the state of Maryland: factors influencing outcome among 527 recent cases. *Journal of Vascular Surgery*. 1998; 28:413-20; discussion 420-1.
 21. Singh JA, Kwok CK, Boudreau RM, Lee GC, Ibrahim SA. Hospital volume and surgical outcomes after elective hip/knee arthroplasty: a risk-adjusted analysis of a large regional database. *Arthritis & Rheumatism*. 2011 Aug;63(8):2531-9.
 22. Mufarrih SH, Ghani MO, Martins RS, Qureshi NQ, Mufarrih SA, Malik AT, Noordin S. Effect of hospital volume on outcomes of total hip arthroplasty: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Orthopaedic Surgery and Research*. 2019 Dec 1;14(1):468.
 23. Jolbäck P, Rolfson O, Cnudde P, Odin D, Malchau H, Lindahl H, Mohaddes M. High annual surgeon volume reduces the risk of adverse events following primary total hip arthroplasty: a registry-based study of 12,100 cases in Western Sweden. *Acta orthopaedica*. 2019 Mar 4;90(2):153-8.
 24. Lau RL, Perruccio AV, Gandhi R, Mahomed NN. The role of surgeon volume on patient outcome in total knee arthroplasty: a systematic review of the literature. *BMC musculoskeletal disorders*. 2012 Dec;13(1):250.
 25. Anderson BR, Ciarleglio AJ, Cohen DJ, Lai WW, Neidell M, Hall M, Glied SA, Bacha EA. The Norwood operation: Relative effects of surgeon and institutional volumes on outcomes and resource utilization. *Cardiology in the Young*. 2016 Apr;26(4):683-92.
 26. Pasquali SK, Jacobs JP, He X, Hornik CP, Jaquiss RD, Jacobs ML, O'Brien SM, Peterson ED, Li JS. The complex relationship between center volume and

- outcome in patients undergoing the Norwood operation. *The Annals of thoracic surgery*. 2012 May 1;93(5):1556-62.
27. Hirsch JC, Gurney JG, Donohue JE, Gebremariam A, Bove EL, Ohye RG. Hospital mortality for Norwood and arterial switch operations as a function of institutional volume. *Pediatric cardiology*. 2008 Jul 1;29(4):713-7.
 28. Hornik CP, He X, Jacobs JP, Li JS, Jaquiss RD, Jacobs ML, O'Brien SM, Welke K, Peterson ED, Pasquali SK. Relative impact of surgeon and center volume on early mortality after the Norwood operation. *The Annals of thoracic surgery*. 2012 Jun 1;93(6):1992-7.
 29. Baker L, O'Sullivan M. Small numbers can have big consequences: many California hospitals perform dangerously low numbers of cancer surgeries. California Health Care Foundation. 2017. <https://www.chcf.org/publication/small-numbers-can-have-big-consequences-many-california-hospitals-perform-dangerously-low-numbers-of-cancer-surgeries/>
 30. Birkmeyer JD, Stukel TA, Siewers AS. Surgeon volume and operative mortality in the United States. *New England Journal of Medicine* 2003; 349: 2117-27.
 31. Birkmeyer JD. High-risk surgery--follow the crowd. *JAMA*. 2000;283:1191-3.

For a comprehensive list of references please review the Hospital and Surgeon Volume Bibliography, available here:

<https://ratings.leapfroggroup.org/measure/hospital/2024/complex-adult-and-pediatric-surgery>